

Supplemental Material for:
Market design for altruistic supply:
Evidence from the Lab
(Robert Slonim and Carmen Wang)

Table of Contents

Appendix A: Tables discussed in the text

Subject and Treatment Balance tables:

Table A2.1:	Subject characteristics by conditions
Table A2.2:	Realizations of subjects at risk and costs by condition

Regression tables that examine market outcomes:

Table A3.1a:	Regressions on lives saved by demand level (first 50 rounds)
Table A3.1b:	Regressions on lives saved by demand level: comparing registries (Diff-In-Diff)
Table A3.2a:	Regressions on help wasted by demand level (first 50 rounds)
Table A3.2b:	Regressions on help wasted by demand level: comparing registries (Diff-In-Diff)
Table A3.3a:	Regressions on payoffs by demand level (first 50 rounds)
Table A3.3b:	Regressions on payoffs by demand level: comparing registries (Diff-In-Diff)
Table A3.4a:	MW tests on efficiency (first 50 rounds)

Regression tables that examine individual decisions:

Table A3.5a:	Regressions on the help decision (first 50 rounds)
Table A3.5b:	Regressions on the help decision: comparing ADI demand levels (Diff-In-Diff)
Table A3.5c:	Regressions on the help decision: comparing registries (Diff-In-Diff)

Appendix B: Full set of instructions

B1: Instructions for first 50 rounds

B2: Additional instructions for last 50 rounds (the treatment conditions):

- B2.1:** Baseline (Control)
- B2.2:** Aggregate Demand Information
- B2.3:** Invitations Once Registry
- B2.4:** Sequential Registry
- B2.5:** Adaptive Registry

Appendix A: Tables discussed in the text

Subject and Treatment Balance tables

Table A2.1 shows the characteristics of the subjects by treatment. In general, there are no major differences across the conditions. One notable exception is that in the ADI condition subjects work fewer hours, have lower family income, donate money less often, donate less money, and volunteer fewer hours. We show below that in the first 50 rounds subjects in the ADI directionally help less often (though not significantly) which could be attributable to these different characteristics. Nonetheless, differences in subject characteristics are controlled for in our main difference in difference analyses of the changes in behavior from the first to last 50 rounds.

Table A2.1: Subject characteristics by conditions

	<u>Controls</u>			<u>Registries</u>		p-values: Test for differences
	<u>Baseline</u>	<u>ADI</u>	<u>Adaptive</u>	<u>Inv. Once</u>	<u>Sequential</u>	
N†	110	110	110	110	140	
Female	54.6%	54.6%	51.8%	50.0%	49.3%	0.886
<u>Academic Information</u>						
Entrance score‡	88.0 (13.6)	88.7 (13.8)	88.5 (13.0)	89.1 (15.2)	87.7 (16.2)	0.920
<u>Majors</u>						0.527
Econ	14.6%	13.6%	18.2%	18.9%	12.5%	
Bus	21.8%	21.8%	30.0%	19.8%	28.7%	
Arts/Soc.Sci	17.3%	17.3%	20.0%	17.0%	21.3%	
Sci/Eng	30.9%	30.0%	21.8%	31.1%	20.6%	
<u>Ethnicity</u>						0.857
Caucasian	42.73%	31.82%	35.45%	40.57%	33.82%	
Asian	43.64%	54.54%	51.81%	46.23%	59.56%	
<u>Monetary Donations in the past year</u>						
Frequency	3.3 (3.4)	2.7 (3.1)	3.6 (3.7)	3.4 (3.6)	3.1 (3.6)	0.057*
Amount	75.9 (130)	44.6 (89)	71.9 (140)	44.2 (86)	64.5 (123)	0.002***
<u>Volunteer Activities in the last year</u>						
Frequency	3.4 (3.9)	2.7 (3.4)	3.1 (3.8)	2.1 (3.1)	2.7 (3.6)	0.002***
Hours	19.9 (31.6)	13.8 (26.0)	17.6 (29.9)	15.2 (27.9)	18.3 (30.3)	0.166
<u>Income and Employment</u>						
Weekly Spending	\$63.2 (36)	\$65.5 (34)	\$62.2 (34)	\$63.9 (35)	\$64.4 (34)	0.887
Work hours/week	5.8 (7.7)	4.6 (7.8)	5.4 (7.4)	6.7 (9.2)	6.1 (8.0)	0.092*
Family Inc (000)	\$74.6 (62)	\$66.1 (60)	\$84.3 (71)	\$78.9 (72)	\$78.9 (63)	0.041**
% Review Questions Correct	92.5%	96.6%	95.7%	95.7%	93.5%	

† 8 missing observations (from the 580 subjects) are due to subjects not completing the final survey. There were also 141 missing entrance scores mainly due to international students unable to estimate an equivalent to the Australian university entrance score.

‡ The university entrance score refers to the Australian Tertiary Admission Rank (ATAR), which is used for university admission decisions across Australia. For more information, see www.uac.edu.au/undergraduate/atar/.

Table A2.2 shows the realization of the number of subjects at risk and costs for each treatment. The table shows the realizations for the first 50 rounds (top panel) and the last 50 rounds (bottom panel). The top row of each cell indicates: (1) the total number of group-rounds in which there were r subjects at risk and (2) the number of groups in which there was at least one observation at this demand level. The bottom row of each cell indicates (3) the average costs for the lowest, second lowest and third lowest subjects who were safe. We indicate in bold if any of these differences are significant across the five treatment conditions (based on multivariate tests of equal means). **Table A2.2** shows that for $r = 0$ to 4, all but two groups (ADI in the first 50 rounds when $r=0$ and $r=4$) have at least one observation, and the most observations occur when $r = 1$ and 2, as expected.

Table A2.2: Realizations of subjects at risk and costs for the first and last 50 rounds by condition

	Baseline	ADI	Sequential	Invite Only One	Adaptive
First 50 Rounds					
R=0	69, 11	55, 10	65, 11	66, 11	62, 14
$p > .5$ for all costs	\$3.15, \$4.61, \$6.20	\$3.49, \$4.64, \$5.92	\$3.40, \$4.90, \$6.13	\$3.38, \$4.74, \$5.88	\$3.22, \$4.50, \$5.75
R=1	146, 11	132, 11	139, 11	144, 11	209, 14
$p > .5$ for all costs	\$3.32, \$4.62, \$6.07	\$3.23, \$4.34, \$5.65	\$3.16, \$4.47, \$5.57	\$3.37, \$4.59, \$5.95	\$3.25, \$4.50, \$5.60
R=2	167, 11	141, 11	167, 11	168, 11	212, 14
$p > .5, > .5, = \mathbf{0.045}$	\$3.32, \$4.49, \$5.83	\$3.45, \$4.69, \$6.14	\$3.35, \$4.61, \$5.89	\$3.20, \$4.33, \$5.60	\$3.37, \$4.68, \$5.95
R=3	100, 11	86, 11	111, 11	111, 11	136, 14
$p > .5$ for all costs	\$3.41, \$4.66, \$5.99	\$3.25, \$4.37, \$5.50	\$3.49, \$4.74, \$6.06	\$3.28, \$4.65, \$5.93	\$3.45, \$4.70, \$5.96
R=4	51, 11	46, 10	54, 11	48, 11	59, 14
$p > .5$ for all costs	\$3.29, \$4.55, \$6.02	\$3.17, \$4.47, \$5.83	\$3.52, \$4.82, \$6.10	\$3.27, \$5.09, \$6.50	\$3.17, \$4.61, \$5.91
R=5	11, 6	12, 7	9, 6	10, 7	18, 12
$p > .5, = \mathbf{0.005}, = \mathbf{0.061}$	\$2.81, \$3.58, \$5.60	\$3.69, \$5.43, \$6.61	\$3.36, \$4.09, \$5.08	\$3.98, \$5.38, \$6.49	\$3.09, \$5.06, \$6.42
Last 50 Rounds					
R=0	58, 11	65, 11	49, 11	43, 11	76, 14
$p = \mathbf{0.056}, > .5, > .5$	\$3.62, \$4.87, \$5.88	\$3.19, \$4.50, \$5.56	\$3.39, \$4.80, \$6.34	\$3.37, \$4.81, \$6.20	\$3.69, \$5.12, \$6.13
R=1	136, 11	143, 11	130, 11	132, 11	159, 14
$p > .5$ for all costs	\$3.25, \$4.62, \$5.86	\$3.28, \$4.64, \$5.87	\$3.25, \$4.55, \$5.84	\$3.43, \$4.75, \$5.83	\$3.36, \$4.65, \$5.71
R=2	173, 11	177, 11	166, 11	172, 11	184, 14
$p > .5$ for all costs	\$3.20, \$4.54, \$5.93	\$3.45, \$4.66, \$5.84	\$3.29, \$4.52, \$5.85	\$3.30, \$4.61, \$6.03	\$3.24, \$4.47, \$5.65
R=3	100, 11	95, 11	134, 11	114, 11	124, 14
$p > .5$ for all costs	\$3.62, \$4.72, \$6.11	\$3.47, \$4.79, \$6.25	\$3.24, \$4.61, \$5.86	\$3.32, \$4.58, \$5.88	\$3.20, \$4.52, \$5.71
R=4	47, 11	42, 11	47, 11	55, 11	50, 14
$p > .5$ for all costs	\$3.70, \$4.70, \$5.91	\$3.31, \$4.86, \$5.83	\$3.51, \$4.70, \$5.72	\$3.37, \$4.43, \$6.11	\$3.17, \$4.57, \$6.14
R=5	20, 9	17, 9	10, 6	20, 9	17, 10
$p > .5$ for all costs	\$3.71, \$5.14, \$6.16	\$3.39, \$4.05, \$5.41	\$3.00, \$4.17, \$5.45	\$3.53, \$4.47, \$5.95	\$3.36, \$4.08, \$5.75

Regression tables that examine market outcomes

Table A3.1a Lives saved, the first 50 rounds

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
	<u>Demand = 1</u>	<u>Demand = 2</u>	<u>Demand = 3</u>	<u>Demand = 4</u>	<u>Demand = 5</u>
Baseline:	.8288	1.335	1.36	1.196	1.364
A.D. Information	0.0591** (0.0258)	-0.00379 (0.0447)	0.0372 (0.0936)	-0.110 (0.161)	-0.0496 (0.297)
Invite Once Registry	0.0530** (0.0222)	0.0470 (0.0361)	0.0975 (0.102)	0.0478 (0.167)	-0.0388 (0.266)
Sequential Registry	0.00784 (0.0387)	0.0313 (0.0361)	0.0292 (0.104)	0.182 (0.206)	-0.424 (0.262)
Adaptive Registry	0.0428* (0.0224)	0.0316 (0.0312)	0.0753 (0.0813)	-0.00904 (0.157)	-0.529*** (0.183)
Controls	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Observations	770	855	544	258	60
Log-Likelihood	-224.4	-918.6	-761.5	-367.8	-76.16
p values:					
A.D.Info = Inv.Once	0.820	0.305	0.468	0.368	0.971
A.D.Info = Sequential	0.178	0.463	0.927	0.161	0.253
A.D.Info = Adaptive	0.546	0.423	0.507	0.587	0.205
Inv.Once = Sequential	0.193	0.694	0.483	0.514	0.140
Inv.Once = Adaptive	0.643	0.667	0.746	0.746	0.154
Sequential = Adaptive	0.264	0.992	0.547	0.351	0.634

Marginal effects on group outcomes. Colum (1) shows probit regression with $Y = 1$ if the one person at risk is saved. Columns (2)-(5) show Tobit regressions with $Y =$ the number of persons saved conditional on being at risk, censored between 0 and the number of persons at risk in a group in a round. The omitted category is the baseline condition. **Sample** consists of first 50 rounds of observations in all treatments, grouped by each demand level from 1 to 5. **Controls:** Dummy variables for every 5 rounds, 5 cost variables for the 5 lowest costs in a group in a round.

Robust standard errors clustered on session level in parentheses; *** $p < 0.01$, ** $p < 0.05$, * $p < 0.1$

Table A3.1b Lives saved in registry conditions, Diff-In-Diff

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
	Demand = 1	Demand = 2	Demand = 3	Demand = 4	Demand = 5
Baseline:	.9097	1.506	1.486	1.083	1.2
Last 50 Rounds	-0.0650*** (0.0171)	-0.00388 (0.0418)	0.0886 (0.0616)	0.0956 (0.157)	-0.240 (0.302)
Sequential Registry	-0.0654 (0.0597)	-0.0178 (0.0424)	-0.0569 (0.0958)	0.172 (0.202)	-0.379 (0.279)
Adaptive Registry	-0.0161 (0.0394)	-0.0168 (0.0371)	-0.0177 (0.0685)	-0.0619 (0.175)	-0.467 (0.300)
Sequential Registry * Last 50 Rounds	0.0458*** (0.0170)	0.0471 (0.0582)	0.0378 (0.107)	-0.214 (0.183)	0.434 (0.371)
Adaptive Registry * Last 50 Rounds	0.0218 (0.0348)	0.0138 (0.0517)	-0.0500 (0.0718)	-0.00464 (0.165)	0.580 (0.623)
Controls	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Observations	913	1,069	730	313	84
Log-Likelihood	-292.1	-1104	-1025	-462.5	-110.4
p values:					
Sequential*Last 50 Rounds = Adaptive*Last 50 Rounds	0.466	0.505	0.345	0.0247**	0.810

Marginal effects on group outcomes. Column (1) shows probit regression with $Y = 1$ if the one person at risk is saved. Columns (2)-(5) show Tobit regressions with $Y =$ the number of persons saved conditional on being at risk, censored between 0 and the number of persons at risk in a group in a round. The omitted category is the Inv. Once Registry. **Sample** consists of all observations in the registry treatments, grouped by each demand level from 1 to 5. Round 51 is excluded in all analysis due to a software error. **Controls:** Dummy variables for every 5 rounds, 5 cost variables for the 5 lowest costs in a group in a round.

Robust standard errors clustered on session level in parentheses; *** $p < 0.01$, ** $p < 0.05$, * $p < 0.1$

Table A3.2a Help wasted, the first 50 rounds

	(0)	(1)	(2)	(3)
	<u>Demand = 0</u>	<u>Demand = 1</u>	<u>Demand = 2</u>	<u>Demand = 3</u>
Baseline:	2.203	.9384	.2635	.03
A.D. Information	-0.213 (0.169)	0.159 (0.183)	0.142 (0.0885)	0.0804 (0.0571)
Invite Once Registry	-0.0182 (0.257)	0.180 (0.148)	0.145 (0.0973)	0.0647 (0.0639)
Sequential Registry	-0.236 (0.176)	0.0276 (0.199)	0.109* (0.0594)	0.0272 (0.0667)
Adaptive Registry	-0.130 (0.222)	0.0922 (0.151)	0.0369 (0.0889)	0.0375 (0.0636)
Controls	Y	Y	Y	Y
Observations	317	770	855	544
Log-Likelihood	-495.7	-1048	-656.7	-99.20
p values:				
A.D.Info = Inv.Once	0.427	0.858	0.972	0.777
A.D.Info = Sequential	0.870	0.475	0.686	0.353
A.D.Info = Adaptive	0.650	0.575	0.318	0.416
Inv.Once = Sequential	0.382	0.353	0.678	0.574
Inv.Once = Adaptive	0.680	0.227	0.320	0.645
Sequential = Adaptive	0.584	0.674	0.384	0.876

Marginal effects on group outcomes. Tobit regressions with Y = the number of ‘help offers’ not used, censored above 0. The omitted category is the baseline condition. There were no ‘help offers’ not used (Y = 0) for 4 persons at risk and above. **Sample** consists of first 50 rounds of observations in all treatments, grouped by each demand level from 0 to 3. **Controls:** Dummy variables for every 5 rounds, 5 cost variables for the 5 lowest costs in a group in a round.

Robust standard errors clustered on session level in parentheses; *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Table A3.2b Help wasted in registry conditions, Diff-In-Diff

	(1)
	<u>Demand = 0</u>
Baseline:	2.242
-----	-----
Last 50 Rounds	-1.338*** (0.108)
Sequential Registry	-0.0806 (0.114)
Adaptive Registry	-0.0596 (0.132)
Sequential Registry * Last 50 Rounds	-0.131 (0.173)
Adaptive Registry * Last 50 Rounds	-0.354** (0.175)
Controls	Y
Observations	361
Log-Likelihood	-378.0
p values:	
Sequential*Last 50 Rounds = Adaptive*Last 50 Rounds	0.212

Marginal effects on group outcomes. Tobit regressions with Y = the number of ‘help offers’ not used, censored above 0. The omitted category is the Inv. Once Registry. **Sample** consists of all observations in the registry treatments at demand level 0. There were too few ‘help offers’ not used for 1 or more persons at risk after treatment (17 in total out of 2712 decisions across all 3 registries). Round 51 is excluded in all analysis due to a software error. **Controls:** Dummy variables for every 5 rounds, 5 cost variables for the 5 lowest costs in a group in a round.

Robust standard errors clustered on session level in parentheses; *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Table A3.3a Group payoffs, the first 50 rounds

	(0)	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
	Demand = 0	Demand = 1	Demand = 2	Demand = 3	Demand = 4	Demand = 5
Baseline:	188.4	187.8	179.0	160.3	138.2	121.6
A.D. Information	0.0742 (1.846)	-0.336 (1.410)	-2.099 (1.531)	0.0546 (2.309)	-1.761 (3.170)	-3.259 (5.834)
Invite Once Registry	-0.139 (2.393)	-0.128 (1.107)	1.042 (1.098)	2.284 (2.444)	-0.165 (2.903)	-5.543 (6.973)
Sequential Registry	0.753 (1.513)	0.279 (1.041)	0.325 (1.420)	0.539 (2.516)	3.582 (4.001)	-9.464 (7.779)
Adaptive Registry	0.574 (1.748)	-0.299 (0.974)	0.718 (1.525)	1.421 (2.075)	-1.217 (2.897)	-11.78 (6.959)
Constant	181.9*** (2.641)	186.3*** (1.798)	194.0*** (1.796)	194.8*** (3.922)	168.0*** (6.172)	164.9*** (15.95)
Controls	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Observations	317	770	855	544	258	60
R-squared	0.117	0.082	0.209	0.321	0.249	0.419
Log-Likelihood	-1100	-2586	-3138	-2139	-1043	-234.7
p values:						
A.D.Info = Inv.Once	0.932	0.862	0.0327	0.270	0.644	0.776
A.D.Info = Sequential	0.646	0.601	0.164	0.809	0.240	0.436
A.D.Info = Adaptive	0.753	0.973	0.125	0.376	0.881	0.385
Inv.Once = Sequential	0.694	0.600	0.591	0.443	0.377	0.596
Inv.Once = Adaptive	0.760	0.799	0.816	0.614	0.744	0.496
Sequential = Adaptive	0.886	0.304	0.820	0.638	0.262	0.777

Coefficients of OLS regressions on group outcomes. Y = the sum of individual payoffs in a group in a round. The omitted category is the baseline condition. **Sample** consists of first 50 rounds of observations in all treatments, grouped by each demand level from 0 to 6. **Controls:** Dummy variables for every 5 rounds, 5 cost variables for the 5 lowest costs in a group in a round.

Robust standard errors clustered on session level in parentheses; *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Table A3.3b Group payoffs in registry conditions, Diff-In-Diff

	(0)	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
	Demand = 0	Demand = 1	Demand = 2	Demand = 3	Demand = 4	Demand = 5
Baseline:	188.0	187.8	180.5	162.0	136.2	116.7
Last 50 Rounds	10.47*** (1.938)	5.326*** (0.675)	1.618 (1.290)	2.720 (1.677)	2.452 (2.548)	-2.582 (5.744)
Sequential Registry	0.862 (2.236)	0.159 (0.847)	-0.657 (1.278)	-1.556 (2.152)	4.339 (4.130)	-5.494 (6.727)
Adaptive Registry	0.950 (2.310)	-0.343 (0.692)	-0.328 (1.303)	-0.818 (1.650)	-1.245 (3.224)	-6.723 (7.319)
Sequential Registry * Last 50 Rounds	0.174 (2.091)	-0.445 (1.306)	1.543 (2.055)	0.286 (2.485)	-6.144 (3.589)	3.311 (7.686)
Adaptive Registry * Last 50 Rounds	-0.150 (2.144)	0.150 (0.805)	0.448 (1.809)	-1.535 (1.731)	-0.419 (2.651)	2.813 (7.995)
Constant	185.0*** (2.715)	191.0*** (1.197)	197.8*** (1.128)	195.7*** (1.827)	167.8*** (4.768)	151.8*** (14.96)
Controls	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Observations	361	913	1,069	730	313	84
R-squared	0.477	0.197	0.224	0.318	0.259	0.347
p values:						
Sequential*Last 50 Rounds = Adaptive*Last 50 Rounds	0.801	0.631	0.577	0.364	0.0243**	0.956

Coefficients of OLS regressions on group outcomes. Y equals the sum of individual payoffs in a group in a round. The omitted category is the Inv. Once Registry. **Sample** consists of all observations in the registry treatments, grouped by each demand level from 0 to 6. Round 51 is excluded in all analysis due to a software error. **Controls:** Dummy variables for every 5 rounds, 5 cost variables for the 5 lowest costs in a group in a round.

Robust standard errors clustered on session level in parentheses; *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Table A3.4a Group efficiency during the first 50 rounds

Each Mean Difference entry shows the Column condition minus the Row condition. E.g., the upper left cell indicates that the ADI condition achieved 4.7 percentage points less efficiency than the Baseline condition

	<u>A.D. Information</u>	<u>Adaptive Registry</u>	<u>Inv. Once Registry</u>	<u>Sequential Registry</u>
<u>Baseline</u>				
Mean Diff	-4.7%	+0.2%	+1.8%	+0.6%
P value	0.1014	0.8977	0.4779	0.8508
Group Obs.	22	22	22	25
<u>A.D. Info</u>				
Mean Diff		+5.0%	+6.6%	+5.3%
P value		0.1330	0.0158**	0.2022
Obs.		22	22	25
<u>Adaptive Reg</u>				
Mean Diff			+1.6%	+0.3%
P value			0.3653	0.8089
Obs.			22	25
<u>Inv. Once Reg</u>				
Mean Diff				-1.3%
P value				0.8931
Obs.				25

p-values from Wilcoxon Mann-Whitney test for comparisons between each pair of treatment conditions.

Sample consists of first 50 rounds of observations in all treatments with one efficiency measure per group.

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Regression tables that examine individual decisions

Table A3.5a Percent helped, the first 50 rounds

	(1)	(2)
Baseline :	.2034	.2034
A.D. Information	0.0204 (0.0388)	0.0223 (0.0382)
Invite Once Registry	0.0235 (0.0289)	0.0264 (0.0290)
Sequential Registry	0.0135 (0.0316)	0.0183 (0.0318)
Adaptive Registry	0.0111 (0.0266)	0.0115 (0.0255)
Cost to help	-0.0979*** (0.00743)	-0.0972*** (0.00724)
Cost to help ²	0.00278*** (0.000373)	0.00275*** (0.000361)
Controls		Y
Observations	22,678	22,678
Log-Likelihood	-8384	-8212
p values:		
A.D. Info = Inv. Once	0.934	0.913
A.D. Info = Sequential	0.866	0.922
A.D. Info = Adaptive	0.802	0.763
Inv. Once = Sequential	0.753	0.792
Inv. Once = Adaptive	0.644	0.552
Sequential = Adaptive	0.937	0.808

Marginal effects of probit regressions on individual decisions. Y equals 1 if a subject helped conditional on being safe. The omitted category is the baseline condition. **Sample** consists of first 50 rounds of observations in all treatments. **Controls:** Dummy variables for every 5 rounds, frequency and amount of monetary donation last year, frequency and hours of volunteering last year, gender, ethnicity, English skills, academic major, university entrance exam performance, weekly work hours, weekly spending, family income.

Robust standard errors clustered on group level in parentheses; *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Table A3.5b Percent helped in Baseline and A.D. Information conditions

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
Y=1 if Helped	All costs	All costs	Cost: \$2.1-5	\$5.1-10	\$10.1-16
Baseline:	.1994	.1994	.5781	.1941	.0127
Last 50 Rounds	-0.0355*** (0.00971)	-0.0348*** (0.00957)	-0.0457* (0.0262)	-0.0728*** (0.0185)	-0.000297 (0.00341)
A.D.Info	0.0288 (0.0305)	0.0286 (0.0299)	0.0216 (0.0669)	0.0249 (0.0382)	0.0171* (0.0100)
A.D.Info *Last 50 Rounds	-0.0254* (0.0146)				
A.D.Info *R1 *Last 50 Rounds		-0.0764*** (0.0114)	-0.271*** (0.0381)	-0.0798*** (0.0191)	-0.00573** (0.00276)
A.D.Info *R2 *Last 50 Rounds		-0.0275* (0.0153)	-0.0887* (0.0470)	-0.0310 (0.0238)	-0.000871 (0.00362)
A.D.Info *R3 *Last 50 Rounds		0.0182 (0.0146)	-0.0541 (0.0495)	0.0306 (0.0260)	0.00759 (0.00878)
A.D.Info *R4 *Last 50 Rounds		0.107*** (0.0265)	0.0821 (0.0681)	0.192*** (0.0643)	0.0163 (0.0146)
A.D.Info *R5 *Last 50 Rounds		0.267*** (0.0439)	0.0444 (0.120)	0.329*** (0.117)	0.129** (0.0515)
Cost to help	-0.0856*** (0.0112)	-0.0843*** (0.0112)	-0.107*** (0.0130)	-0.0444*** (0.00522)	-0.00142*** (0.000705)
Cost to help ²	0.00269*** (0.000541)	0.00264*** (0.000540)			
Controls	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Observations	14,360	14,360	3,037	5,212	5,948
Log-Likelihood	-4746	-4669	-1892	-1973	-612.4
p values:					
Last 50 Rounds*R1 = Last 50 Rounds*R2		0.000***	0.000***	0.000795***	0.0214**
Last 50 Rounds*R1 = Last 50 Rounds*R3		0.000***	0.000***	0.000***	0.000734***
Last 50 Rounds*R1 = Last 50 Rounds*R4		0.000***	0.000***	0.000***	0.0194**
Last 50 Rounds*R1 = Last 50 Rounds*R5		0.000***	0.0151**	0.000***	0.000***
Last 50 Rounds*R2 = Last 50 Rounds*R3		0.001***	0.484	0.0173**	0.00831***

Last 50 Rounds*R2 =	0.000***	0.0416**	0.000***	0.0588*
Last 50 Rounds*R4				
Last 50 Rounds*R2 =	0.000***	0.308	0.000***	0.000***
Last 50 Rounds*R5				
Last 50 Rounds*R3 =	0.000***	0.0232**	0.00432***	0.446
Last 50 Rounds*R4				
Last 50 Rounds*R3 =	0.000***	0.436	0.000636***	0.000***
Last 50 Rounds*R5				
Last 50 Rounds*R4 =	0.000***	0.755	0.202	0.00129***
Last 50 Rounds*R5				

Marginal effects of probit regressions on individual decisions. Y = 1 if an individual helped conditional on being safe in a round. The omitted category is Inv.Once Registry in Part 1, and the baseline treatment in Part 2 of this table. **Samples:** Part 1 includes observations in the registry conditions; Part 2 includes observations in the baseline and A.D. information conditions. We include observations in demand levels from 1 to 5 only in Part 2, since no one helped when Demand = 0 in information condition in last 50 rounds and risk > 5 have only 56 observations. Round 51 is excluded in all analysis due to a software error. **Controls:** Dummies for every 5 rounds, frequency and amount of monetary donation last year, frequency and hours of volunteering last year, gender, ethnicity, English skills, academic major, university entrance exam performance, weekly work hours, weekly spending, family income.

Robust standard errors clustered on group level in parentheses; *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Table A3.5c Percent helped in registry conditions

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Y=1 if Helped	All costs	Cost: \$2.1-5	\$5.1-10	\$10.1-16
Percent help in Inv. Once in Rds 1-50:	.2252	.6305	.2100	.03452
Last 50 Rounds	-0.0573*** (0.0137)	-0.202*** (0.0283)	-0.0473** (0.0240)	-0.00604 (0.00478)
Sequential Registry	-0.00755 (0.0243)	-0.0408 (0.0591)	-0.000943 (0.0357)	0.000246 (0.00931)
Adaptive Registry	-0.0167 (0.0188)	-0.0443 (0.0491)	-0.0260 (0.0269)	0.00104 (0.00817)
Sequential Registry * Last 50 Rounds	-0.00840 (0.0168)	-0.0141 (0.0478)	-0.0162 (0.0259)	0.00298 (0.0105)
Adaptive Registry * Last 50 Rounds	0.00112 (0.0160)	0.0113 (0.0462)	0.00218 (0.0303)	-0.00210 (0.00606)
Cost to help	-0.0746*** (0.00528)	-0.0929*** (0.00958)	-0.0589*** (0.00407)	-0.00376*** (0.000840)
Cost to help ²	0.00198*** (0.000289)			
Controls	Y	Y	Y	Y
Observations	27,880	5,948	9,974	11,958
Log-Likelihood	-9686	-3836	-4255	-1448
p values:				
Sequential*Last 50 Rounds = Adaptive*Last 50 Rounds	0.518	0.615	0.386	0.572

Appendix B: Full set of instructions

Table of Contests:

B1: Instructions for first 50 rounds

B2: Instructions for last 50 rounds (the treatment conditions):

B2.1: Baseline (Control)

B2.2: Aggregate Demand Information

B2.3: Invitations Once Registry

B2.4: Sequential Registry

B2.5: Adaptive Registry

Appendix B1: Instructions for first 50 rounds

Instructions – Part 1

Please do not read this material until instructed to.

Please do not touch your computer until we have completed the instructions.

Welcome

Thank you for coming to today's experiment.

Please do not talk with anyone and do not look at what anyone else is doing. If at any point you have any questions, please raise your hand - an experimenter will come over and answer your question privately.

In this experiment, you will be asked to make many decisions. Your decisions and the decisions of others in this room will determine how much money you will earn. I will explain shortly exactly how these decisions will affect your pay. So please listen carefully.

All of your decisions today will be kept completely anonymous. No one else during or after the experiment will ever know what choices you made in the experiment. We will also keep all the information we collect today anonymous so that your names or any other form of your identity cannot ever be associated with the choices you made today.

We will pay you in cash for everything you have earned today at the end of the experiment. However, you will not receive anything if you leave before we conclude the experiment for everyone.

You will need to complete a set of review questions to ensure that you and everyone completely understand the instructions before starting the experiment. At the end of the experiment the computer will randomly choose one of the review questions and if you answered that question correctly, you will earn an extra \$3, so again please pay attention to the instructions.

Overview of Today's Experiment

Today's experiment has 2 parts with 50 rounds in each part. At the end of the experiment we will randomly choose 1 round from each part and your earnings in these 2 rounds determine how much you will receive. Therefore, your total earnings will be your earnings in these two rounds *plus* a \$10 participation fee *and* \$3 if you answered the review questions correctly. *Importantly, since you do not know in advance which two rounds you will get paid for, we encourage you to make your decisions in every round as if that is the round that you will get paid for.*

I will now explain what will happen in each round for the first 50 rounds. We will complete the first 50 rounds first. Then I will give you additional instructions regarding any possible changes for the last 50 rounds.

You will be randomly assigned to a group. Each group has exactly 10 participants. You will stay in the same GROUP for all 100 rounds of this experiment.

Overview of Each Round

In each round you will start with \$20.

You can be either **SAFE** or **AT RISK**.

- If you are **At Risk**, you do not make any decision in that round. You will lose your \$20 if you do not receive Help from your group members, and you will keep your \$20 if you receive Help.
- If you are **Safe**, you will decide whether to Help one of your group members who is At Risk. If you decide to Help, you will incur a **Cost**.

I will now take you through a round step by step and explain

- how we determine if you will be Safe or At Risk,
 - if you are At Risk, whether you will be Saved or Not Saved,
 - if you are Safe and choose to Help, whether you actually Save someone,
- and how your earnings for each round will be determined

Please now look at your screen while I read the instructions. The 1st screen in each round will display your endowment, \$20, and whether you are Safe or At Risk for that round. Your screen shows the case where you are At Risk.

Your status of At Risk or Safe is determined by a random draw for each round before this screen is shown. The chance that you will be At Risk will be exactly 20% and the chance you will be Safe will be exactly 80%. This process is identical for everyone and for every round. Your chance of being At Risk is always 20% for each round. It is not affected by your results in previous rounds or the status of other group members. For example:

- If you are At Risk this round, it does not imply you will be less likely to be At Risk in the next round. The chance is always 20%; and
- If you are At Risk this round, it does not imply other group members will be less likely to be At Risk. The chance for each of them is still exactly 20%.

If you are At Risk, you will lose ALL of your \$20 for this round unless some group member helps you and you will not make any decision in this round. Please wait patiently for your group members to make their decisions.

Your screen now shows the case where you are Safe. If you are Safe, you will see your “COST”.

- Your COST is unique for you;
- it is chosen randomly from \$2.00, \$2.10, \$2.20 and so on in 10 cent intervals up to \$16.00, with all values equally likely to be chosen; and
- it is determined independently every round – knowing your own COST will not tell you anything about anyone else’s cost, and your COST in previous rounds will not tell you anything about your COST in future rounds.

If you are Safe, you will have the option to Help or Not Help. If you choose Help, you can *potentially* save at most one group member in this round, e.g. you will definitely save one member if more group members are At Risk than those who choose Help. However, your Help may not be needed if more group members choose Help than those At Risk.

Importantly, in any situation, you will not know whether your HELP was actually needed.

If you are Safe, you will not know exactly how many other members of your group are At Risk. However, given that each of the other nine people in your group has a 20% chance of being At Risk does not mean that exactly 20% of them will be At Risk. Instead, it means that:

13% chance 0 members At Risk
 30% chance 1 member at Risk
 30% chance 2 members at Risk
 18% chance 3 members at Risk
 7% chance 4 members at Risk
 2% chance 5 or more members At Risk

If you choose Help, your earnings for this round will be \$20 minus your COST. You will always pay your COST regardless of whether your help was needed.

If you choose Not Help, your earnings for this round will be \$20.

Once you have made your decision, please wait for everyone to complete their decisions and the outcome screen will follow. Three situations are possible.

- *If the number of people who choose Help equals the number of people who are At Risk, everyone who chose Help will save someone and everyone who was At Risk will be saved.*

- *If there are more people At Risk than choose Help*, everyone who chose Help will save someone, but not everyone who was At Risk will be saved. For example, if 2 group members chose Help while 3 members were At Risk, only 2 of the 3 members will be saved. The people saved will be determined randomly with each person At Risk having an equal chance to be saved.
- *If there are less people At Risk than choose Help*, everyone At Risk will be saved, but not everyone who chose Help will have saved someone. For example, if 5 members chose Help while 3 were At Risk, all 3 members will be saved and 2 of the members who chose Help will not have saved anyone. But note that all 5 members would have incurred their costs.

When you are making your decision, you will not know how many other group members are At Risk or Safe; you will not know what any other group members' costs are; and you will not know other group members' decisions. Also, if you choose Help, you will not know if you actually save someone.

Round Earnings Summary

The next screen displays the outcome and your earnings. These include:

- Your initial status: You were At Risk or Safe
- If you are At Risk
 - and Saved, you will receive **\$20**
 - and Not Saved, you will receive **0**
- If you are Safe
 - and choose Not Help, you will receive **\$20**
 - and choose Help, you will receive **\$20 minus your COST**

Experiment earnings summary

The outcome screen completes a round and a new round will start after everyone acknowledges their earnings.

You will complete 50 rounds using these procedures. You will then receive instructions for the last 50 rounds.

After everyone completes the last 50 rounds, the final screen will display how much you earned for each of the 100 rounds. At this point we will roll dice to randomly choose 1 round from the first 50 rounds and 1 round the last 50 rounds. You will receive the sum of your earnings in these two rounds. We will choose the same two rounds for everyone in the room and all rounds will be equally likely to be chosen. For example:

- if you receive \$20 for both rounds chosen, then you will have a total of \$40.
- if you receive \$20 for one of the rounds chosen and \$8 for the other round, then you will have a total of \$28 for the two rounds.
- if you receive 0 for both rounds chosen, then you will have a total of \$0 for the two rounds.

As these examples show, you can earn any amount from \$0 to \$40 for the two rounds chosen.

You will then complete a short survey and this concludes today's experiment. Please sit quietly until you are called to receive your payments.

Your final payoff for today's experiment will be: a show up fee of \$10 + \$3 if you answered a randomly chosen review question correctly + your earnings for the two randomly chosen rounds.

Appendix B2.1: Instructions for the Baseline (Control) condition for the last 50 rounds

Instructions – Part 2

You have completed the first 50 rounds and we will now review the instructions again before completing the last 50 rounds.

Please pay still close attention to these instructions. We will revisit the first set of review questions after these instructions. At the end of the experiment, we will select one of the review questions and if you answered it correctly again, we will give you an additional \$2.

For the last 50 rounds you will continue to be with the same group of 10 people as you were before. **The task will be identical to the first 50 rounds and I will briefly review the key instructions to ensure everyone now understand the tasks completely.**

The 1st screen in each round will display your endowment, \$20, whether you are Safe or At Risk, and the summary information.

Your screen shows the case where you are At Risk. Your status of being At Risk or Safe is still determined by a random draw and everyone's chance of being At Risk is still 20% for each round. Note again, your chance of being At Risk is not affected by your results in previous rounds or the status of your other group members.

If you are At Risk, you will lose ALL of your \$20 for the round unless some group member helps you and you will not make any decision in this round. Please wait patiently for your group members to make their decisions.

Your screen now shows the case where you are Safe. If you are SAFE, you will again see your own "COST," which is drawn randomly from \$2.00 to \$16.00 in 10 cent increments. You have the option to either Help or Not Help.

Also Identical to the first 50 rounds:

- If fewer people choose Help than those At Risk, those who receive Help will be chosen randomly.
- If you choose to Help, your earnings for this round will be \$20 minus your COST. You will always pay your COST regardless of whether you actually SAVE anyone.
- If you choose Not Help, your earnings for this round will be \$20.

The outcome screen displays the outcome and your earnings. These include:

- Your initial status: You were At Risk or Safe
- If you are At Risk
 - and Saved, you will receive **\$20**
 - and Not Saved, you will receive **0**
- If you are Safe
 - and choose Not Help, you will receive **\$20**
 - and choose Help, you will receive **\$20 minus your COST**

This concludes a round and a new round will start after everyone acknowledges their earnings. You will complete the last 50 rounds following these procedures.

B2.2: Instructions for the Aggregate Demand Information condition for the last 50 rounds

Instructions – Part 2

You have completed the first 50 rounds and we will now review the instructions again before completing the last 50 rounds.

Please pay still close attention to these instructions. After these instructions you will have some review questions. At the end of the experiment, we will select one of these review questions and if you answered it correctly, we will give you an additional \$2.

For the last 50 rounds you will continue to be with the same group of 10 people as you were before. **The task will be almost identical to the first 50 rounds. I will briefly review the key instructions to ensure everyone now understand the tasks completely, and explain the one change.**

The 1st screen in each round will display your endowment, \$20, whether you are Safe or At Risk, and the summary information.

Your screen shows the case where you are At Risk. Your status of being At Risk or Safe is still determined by a random draw and everyone's chance of being At Risk is still 20% for each round. Note again, your chance of being At Risk is not affected by your results in previous rounds or the status of your other group members.

If you are At Risk, you will lose ALL of your \$20 for the round unless some group member helps you and you will not make any decision in this round. Please wait patiently for your group members to make their decisions.

Your screen now shows the case where you are Safe. If you are SAFE, you will again see your own "COST," which is drawn randomly from \$2.00 to \$16.00 in 10 cent increments. You have the option to either Help or Not Help.

Also Identical to the first 50 rounds:

- If fewer people choose Help than those At Risk, those who receive Help will be chosen randomly.
- If you choose to Help, your earnings for this round will be \$20 minus your COST. You will always pay your COST regardless of whether you actually SAVE anyone.
- If you choose Not Help, your earnings for this round will be \$20.

The change from the first 50 rounds is that if you are Safe you will also be told how many people in your group are At Risk each round. This is shown on your screen, and everyone in your group who is safe will see this information. Note that the more people who are At Risk also means that there are fewer people who are Safe. For instance, if you are Safe and there is 1 person At Risk, then there are 8 others besides you who are Safe, and if you are Safe and there are 3 people At Risk, then there are 6 others besides you who are Safe

The outcome screen displays the outcome and your earnings. These include:

- Your initial status: You were At Risk or Safe
- If you are At Risk
 - and Saved, you will receive **\$20**
 - and Not Saved, you will receive **0**
- If you are Safe
 - and choose Not Help, you will receive **\$20**
 - and choose Help, you will receive **\$20 minus your COST**

This concludes a round and a new round will start after everyone acknowledges their earnings. You will complete the last 50 rounds following these procedures.

B2.3: Instructions for the Invitations Once Registry condition for the last 50 rounds

Instructions – Part 2

You have completed the first 50 rounds and we will now give you instructions for the last 50 rounds.

Please pay close attention to these instructions. We will give you another set of review questions after these instructions. At the end of the experiment we will select one of the review questions and if you answered it correctly we will give you an additional \$2.

For the last 50 rounds you will continue to be with the same group of 10 people as you were before.

As before, the 1st screen in each round will display your endowment, \$20, whether you are Safe or At Risk, and the summary information.

Your screen shows the case where you are At Risk. Your status of being At Risk or Safe is still determined by a random draw and everyone's chance of being At Risk is still 20% for each round. Note again, your chance of being AT RISK is not affected by your results in previous rounds or the status of your other group members.

If you are At Risk, you will lose ALL of your \$20 for this round unless some group member helps you and you will not make any decision in this round. Please wait patiently for your group members to make their decisions.

Your screen now shows the case where you are Safe. If you are SAFE, you will again see your own "COST," which is drawn randomly from \$2.00 to \$16.00 in 10 cent increments.

For the last 50 rounds we introduce a "Registry."

On your screen, you can see you now have the option to DECIDE NOW or to JOIN the REGISTRY.

If you choose to DECIDE NOW, your next screen will give you the option to either Help or Not Help, which is identical to the previous 50 rounds.

Alternatively, if you choose to JOIN the REGISTRY, you will not help immediately; instead you will be invited to help only if your help is needed in this round.

As displayed in the registry field on the left hand side of the screen

Note that the registry knows

- (a) how many members are At Risk in this round,
- (b) how many members have chosen to HELP now and
- (c) how many members joined the registry.

If more people are At Risk than chose to Help Now, some members who joined the registry will be invited to help.

The registry will only invite the exact number of people needed to help. For example, if 3 members are at risk in this round, 1 member chose to Help Now outside of the registry, and 5 members joined the registry, then 2 out of those 5 members will be invited to help. For another example, if 2 members are at risk in this round, 3 members chose to Help Now outside of the registry, and 5 members joined the registry, then no member will be invited to Help because more people have chosen to Help than those who are At Risk.

If you join the registry, you will then indicate your **willingness to help**. **The registry will use your willingness to help, along with everyone else's willingness to determine who to invite.**

Specifically,

- (a) the registry will invite people who indicated willingness 3 (MOST) if more people are At Risk than those who chose to Help Now;

- (b) in addition, the registry will invite people who indicated willingness 2 if more people are At Risk than those who chose to Help Now *and* those who indicated willingness 3; and
- (c) the registry will also invite people who indicated willingness 1 (LEAST) if more people are At Risk than those who chose Help Now *and* those who indicated willingness 3 or 2.

If more people are in the same willingness group than those to be invited, the registry will randomly choose the people to invite in this willingness group. For example, if the registry needs to invite 2 people from the group with willingness 3, and 4 people indicated willingness 3, then 2 of these 4 people will be chosen randomly.

Here are two examples to demonstrate how the registry will work.

Example 1: Suppose there are

- 3 people At Risk.
- 1 person who choose Help Now,
- 3 people who join the registry and choose willingness 3 (MOST), and
- 3 people who join the registry and choose willingness 2

In this example,

- the person who chose Help Now will save 1 person At Risk for sure, and
- 2 of the 3 people who chose willingness 3 will be randomly chosen and invited to Help the other 2 people At Risk.
- No one else will be able to Help.

Example 2: Suppose there are

- 3 people At Risk
- 0 people who choose Help Now,
- 1 person who join the registry and choose willingness 3 (MOST)
- 1 person who join the registry and choose willingness 2
- 3 people who join the registry and choose willingness 1 (LEAST), and
- 2 people who choose Not Help

In this example,

- the 2 people who chose willingness 3 and 2 will be invited to Help,
- 1 of the 3 people who chose willingness 1 will be randomly chosen and invited to Help, and
- no one else will be able to Help.

Once every member has decided to Help Now, Not Help or joined the registry and submitted their willingness, the registry will notify you whether your help is needed. If you do not need to help in this round, no further decision is required. If your help is needed, you then need to decide whether to Help or Not Help as shown on this screen.

Important: You will only be invited to Help if you join the registry and the registry will only invite the exact number of people needed to help. This means that if you are invited and choose Help, one member will be saved for sure. On the other hand, this also means that if you are invited but choose Not Help, one member will not be saved for sure since no one else will be invited to help one of the people At Risk.

Identical to the first 50 rounds:

- If fewer people choose Help than those At Risk, those who receive Help will be chosen randomly. If you choose Help Now, there is a chance that your Help may not save anyone, However, if you join the registry and are invited to help, your help will save someone for sure.
- If you choose to Help, your earnings for this round will be \$20 minus your COST. You will always pay your COST regardless of whether you actually SAVE anyone.
- If you choose Not Help, your earnings for this round will be \$20.

Round Earnings Summary

Identical to the first 50 rounds:

The outcome screen displays the outcome and your earnings. These include:

- Your initial status: You were At Risk or Safe
- If you are At Risk
 - and Saved, you will receive **\$20**
 - and Not Saved, you will receive **0**
- If you are Safe
 - and choose Not Help, you will receive **\$20**
 - and choose Help, you will receive **\$20 minus your COST**

This concludes a round and a new round will start after everyone acknowledges their earnings. You will complete the last 50 rounds following these procedures.

B2.4: Instructions for the Sequential Registry condition for the last 50 rounds

Instructions – Part 2

You have completed the first 50 rounds and we will now give you instructions for the last 50 rounds.

Please pay close attention to these instructions. We will give you another set of review questions after these instructions. At the end of the experiment we will select one of these questions and if you answered it correctly we will give you an additional \$2.

For the last 50 rounds you will continue to be with the same group of 10 people as the first 50 rounds.

As before, the 1st screen in each round will display your endowment, \$20, whether you are Safe or At Risk, and the summary information.

Your screen shows the case where you are At Risk. Your status of being At Risk or Safe is still determined by a random draw and everyone's chance of being At Risk is still 20% for each round. Note again, your chance of being At Risk is not affected by your results in previous rounds or the status of your other group members.

If you are At Risk, you will lose ALL of your \$20 for this round unless some group member helps you and you will not make any decision in this round. Please wait patiently for your group members to make their decisions.

Your screen now shows the case where you are Safe. If you are SAFE, you will again see your own "COST," which is drawn randomly from \$2.00 to \$16.00 in 10 cent increments.

For the last 50 rounds we introduce a "Registry."

On your screen, you can see you now have the option to DECIDE NOW or to JOIN the REGISTRY.

If you choose to DECIDE NOW, your next screen will give you the option to either Help or Not Help, which is identical to the previous 50 rounds.

Alternatively, if you choose to JOIN the REGISTRY, you will not help immediately; instead you will be invited to help only if your help is needed in this round.

As displayed in the registry field on the left hand side of the screen

Note that the registry knows

- (a) how many members are At Risk in this round,
- (b) how many members have chosen to HELP now and
- (c) how many members joined the registry.

If more people are At Risk than chose to Help Now, the registry will be used to invite more people to help. **Specifically, the registry will sequentially invite members to help until either everyone who is At Risk is saved, or until there is no one left in the registry to ask.** Here are two examples:

Example 1: Suppose there are:

- 3 members At Risk,
- 1 member choose to Help Now outside of the registry,
- 2 members choose Not Help outside the registry, and
- 4 members join the registry.

In this example, 2 of the 4 members who join the registry will be initially invited to help:

- *If both of them choose to Help*, no one else in the registry will be asked to Help, and all 3 people At Risk will be saved.
- *If 1 of them chooses to Help*, 1 of the remaining 2 members in the registry will be asked to Help,

- If that person chooses to Help, then the final person in the registry will not be asked to Help and all 3 people At Risk will be saved.
- If that person chooses to Not Help, then the final person in the registry will be asked to help. If that person chooses to Help, then once again all 3 people At Risk will be saved, and if that person chooses to Not Help, then only 2 of three people At Risk will be saved.
- *And if both initially invited to help choose to Not Help*, then the 2 remaining members of the registry will be asked to help.

Example 2: Suppose there are:

- 2 members At Risk,
- 3 members choose to Help Now outside of the registry, and
- 5 members join the registry,

In this example, no member of the registry will be invited to Help because more people chose to Help Now outside the registry than those At Risk.

If you join the registry, you will then be asked to indicate your **willingness to help**. **The registry will use your willingness to help, along with everyone else's willingness to determine who to invite.** Specifically, the registry will start by inviting people in order from those who indicated willingness 3 (MOST) to willingness 2 and finally to willingness 1 (LEAST) until either everyone At Risk has been saved or there is no one left in the registry to invite.

If more people are in the same willingness group than those to be invited, the registry will randomly choose the order in which to invite people in this willingness group. For example, if the registry needs to initially invite 2 people from the group with willingness 3, and 4 people indicated willingness 3, then 2 of these 4 people will be chosen randomly to be invited first.

Here is an example to demonstrate the order in which the registry will invite members.

Example: Suppose there are

- 3 people At Risk.
- 1 person who chose Help Now,
- 3 people who join the registry and choose willingness 3 (MOST), and
- 3 person who join the registry and choose willingness 2

In this example,

- the person who chose Help Now will save 1 person At Risk. There will still be 2 people At Risk, so
- 2 of the 3 people who chose willingness 3 will be randomly chosen to initially be invited to Help the other 2 people At Risk.
- If either of these people choose to Not Help, there will still be someone At Risk, so the third person in willingness 3 will be asked to Help.
- If there are still people At Risk after everyone in willingness 3 has been asked, then the registry will randomly choose among the members in willingness 2 to Help until everyone is saved or until there is no one else left to invite.

Important: If you join the registry and are invited to Help, one member who was At Risk will be saved for sure since the registry will only invite you if there is someone At Risk who has not yet been saved. On the other hand, if you join the registry and are invited to Help but choose to Not Help, it is still possible that the person At Risk may be saved if there is someone else remaining in the registry who will choose to help.

Identical to the first 50 rounds:

- If fewer people choose Help than those At Risk, those who receive Help will be chosen randomly.
If you choose Help Now, there is a chance that your Help may not save anyone, However, if you join the registry and are invited to help, your help will save someone for sure.
- If you choose to Help, your earnings for this round will be \$20 minus your COST. You will always pay your COST regardless of whether you actually SAVE anyone.
- If you choose Not Help, your earnings for this round will be \$20.

Round Earnings Summary

Identical to the first 50 rounds:

The outcome screen displays the outcome and your earnings. These include:

- Your initial status: You were At Risk or Safe

- If you are At Risk
 - and Saved, you will receive **\$20**
 - and Not Saved, you will receive **0**

- If you are Safe
 - and choose Not Help, you will receive **\$20**
 - and choose Help, you will receive **\$20 minus your COST**

This concludes a round and a new round will start after everyone acknowledges their earnings. You will complete the last 50 rounds following these procedures.

B2.5: Instructions for the Adaptive condition for the last 50 rounds

Instructions – Part 2

You have completed the first 50 rounds and we will now give you instructions for the last 50 rounds.

Please pay close attention to these instructions. We will give you another set of review questions after these instructions. At the end of the experiment we will select one of the review questions and if you answered it correctly we will give you an additional \$2.

For the last 50 rounds you will continue to be with the same group of 10 people as you were before.

As before, the 1st screen in each round will display your endowment, \$20, whether you are Safe or At Risk, and the summary information.

Your screen shows the case where you are At Risk. Your status of being At Risk or Safe is still determined by a random draw and everyone's chance of being At Risk is still 20% for each round. Note again, your chance of being At Risk is not affected by your results in previous rounds or the status of your other group members.

If you are At Risk, you will lose ALL of your \$20 for this round unless some group member helps you and you will not make any decision in this round. Please wait patiently for your group members to make their decisions.

Your screen now shows the case where you are Safe. If you are SAFE, you will again see your own "COST," which is drawn randomly from \$2.00 to \$16.00 in 10 cent increments.

For the last 50 rounds we introduce a "Registry."

On your screen, you can see you now have the option to DECIDE NOW or to JOIN the REGISTRY.

If you choose to DECIDE NOW, your next screen will give you the option to either Help or Not Help, which is identical to the previous 50 rounds.

Alternatively, if you choose to JOIN the REGISTRY, you will not help immediately; instead you will be invited to help only if your help is needed in this round.

As displayed in the registry field on the left hand side of the screen

Note that the registry knows

- (a) how many members are At Risk in this round,
- (b) how many members have chosen to HELP now and
- (c) how many members joined the registry.

If more people are At Risk than chose to Help Now, some members who joined the registry will be invited to help.

The registry will only invite the exact number of people needed to help. For example, if 3 members are at risk in this round, 1 member chose to Help Now outside of the registry, and 5 members joined the registry, then 2 out of those 5 members will be invited to help. For another example, if 2 members are at risk in this round, 3 members chose to Help Now outside of the registry, and 5 members joined the registry, then no member will be invited to Help because more people have chosen to Help than those who are At Risk.

If you join the registry, you will then be asked to indicate your **willingness to help**. You may choose Willingness 3 (meaning MOST willing), Willingness 2 or Willingness 1 (meaning LEAST willing). **The registry will use your willingness to help, along with everyone else's willingness to help, to determine who to invite.**

Once every member has decided to Help Now, Not Help or joined the registry and indicated their willingness, the registry will determine who to invite to help. If you are not invited to help, no further decision is required. If you are invited to help, you will then need to decide whether to Help or Not Help as shown on this screen.

Important: You will only be invited to Help if you join the registry and the registry will only invite the exact number of people needed to help. This means that if you are invited and choose Help, one member will be saved for sure. On the other hand, this also means that if you are invited but choose to Not Help, one member will NOT be saved for sure since no one else will be invited to help one of the people At Risk.

Identical to the first 50 rounds:

- If fewer people choose Help than those At Risk, those who receive Help will be chosen randomly.
If you choose Help Now, there is a chance that your Help may not save anyone, However, if you join the registry and are invited to help, your help will save someone for sure.
- If you choose to Help, your earnings for this round will be \$20 minus your COST. You will always pay your COST regardless of whether you actually SAVE anyone.
- If you choose Not Help, your earnings for this round will be \$20.

Round Earnings Summary

Identical to the first 50 rounds:

The outcome screen displays the outcome and your earnings. These include:

- Your initial status: You were At Risk or Safe
- If you are At Risk
 - and Saved, you will receive **\$20**
 - and Not Saved, you will receive **0**
- If you are Safe
 - and choose Not Help, you will receive **\$20**
 - and choose Help, you will receive **\$20 minus your COST**

This concludes a round and a new round will start after everyone acknowledges their earnings. You will complete the last 50 rounds following these procedures.